

**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
Citizens' Advisory Committee**

**MEETING MINUTES (DRAFT)**

**Tuesday, March 15, 2016**

**5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.**

**525 Golden Gate Ave., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Tuolumne Conference Room**

**Members:**

<b>Wendy Aragon, Chair (D1)</b>	Kelly Groth (D7)	Nicole Sandkulla - (M-Reg'l Water Customers)
Suki Kott (D2)	Shalini Swaroop (D8)	Rebecca Lee, (M-Eng./Financial)
Leslie DeTaillandier (D3)	Art Taylor (D9)	Tamar Barlev (M-Lg Water User)
Amy Zock (D4)	Marjorie Goodwin (D10)	Eli Saddler (B-Small Business)
Ted Loewenberg (D5)	Jennifer Clary (D11)	Vacant (B-Env Justice)
Mark Connors (D6)	Avni Jamdar (M-Env. Group)	

M = Mayoral appointment, B = Board President Appointment

Staff Liaison: Tracy Zhu and Jessie Buendia

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**1. Call to order and roll call: Meeting call to order at 5:37pm**

Members present at roll call: (10) Aragon, DeTaillandier, Zock, Loewenberg, Groth, Swaroop, Clary, Jamdar, Lee, Barlev

Members absent at roll call (6): Kott, Connors, Taylor, Goodwin, Sandkulla, Saddler

Members of the public: Beth Rubenstein, Supervisor John Avalos; Sonja Trauss, SFBA Renters Federation; Tom Birmingham; Clint Griess; Charlie Sciammas, PODER; Jessie Fernandez, PODER; Mara Blitzer, Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development; Emily Lesk, MOHCD.

SFPUC staff present: Juliet Ellis, Emily Lam

**2. Report from the Chair - Wendy Aragon, Chair**

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
- [Commission report](#)
- Introduction of a [ceremonial resolution honoring Dr. Espanola Jackson](#)

Public Comment: none.

**3. Staff Report**

- Assistant General Manager, Juliet Ellis, introduced new staff members: Tracy Zhu is leaving the CAC and joined the Agency's staff; she will staff the CAC. Emily Lam is the new Policy and Governmental Affairs Director. AGM Ellis thanked staff, Jessica Buendia, Ryan Iwata and Emily Alt, for their service.
- Emily Lam talked about potential state legislation on Prop 218.

**Edwin M. Lee**  
Mayor

**Francesca Vietor**  
President

**Anson Moran**  
Vice President

**Ann Moller Caen**  
Commissioner

**Vince Courtney**  
Commissioner

**Ike Kwon**  
Commissioner

**Harlan L. Kelly, Jr.**  
General Manager



- Member Clary added that there is a potential ballot measure to amend the state charter to address tiered water rates, low-income assistance, and stormwater rates.
- Member Swaroop asked for clarification about the legality of local agencies weighing in on state ballot measures. Emily Lam clarified that she was providing education on potential state level action to clarify Prop 218.

Public Comment: none.

4. **Approval** of the [February 16, 2016](#) meeting minutes

Motion was made (Swaroop) and seconded (Lee) to approve [February 16, 2016](#) minutes.

Public comment: none

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

AYES: (10) Aragon, DeTaillandier, Zock, Loewenberg, Groth, Swaroop, Clary, Jamdar, Lee, Barlev

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (6): Kott, Connors, Taylor, Goodwin, Sandkulla, Saddler

5. **Public Comment:** members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda (*2 minutes per speaker*)

- Sonya Trauss recommended adding language to the Balboa Reservoir resolution that advises decision-makers to maximize the overall number of housing units rather than the percentage and ensures a competitive bid process.

**Member Taylor arrives at 5:59 pm** (11 members present)

6. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Biosolids Update](#)

**Presenter:** Carolyn Chiu, SFPUC Senior Engineer

Presentation Covered:

- Southeast Treatment Plant background
- Presentation summary of Biosolids Project- Conceptual Engineering Report
- Revised Biosolids Project cost and schedule
- CER process flow diagram
- Key project features and comparisons from old to new facilities

7. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Headworks Update](#)

**Presenter:** Jignesh Desai, SFPUC Project Manager

Presentation Covered:

- Project needs
- Project objectives and levels of service
- SEP site layout
- Scope of work
  - Site preparation and demolition of old 011 Headworks
  - Bruce Flynn Pump Station Improvements
  - Main Headworks facility with odor control structure

- Staging areas
- Project delivery method
- Environmental
- Project budget and schedule

Topics of Discussion:

- Member Loewenberg asked about the expected life expectancy of the equipment. Chiu provided answer.
- Member Clary asked about consideration for the project to be net zero energy. Chiu stated that the profile of the project will not be net zero energy.
- Member Clary asked about the availability of space for a future recycled water plant at the Southeast campus. Chiu responded that there will be potential space after the removal of the existing Biosolid Digesters.
- Member Clary asked about the stormwater capacity of the new headworks and expectations of green infrastructure projects to reduce stormwater flows. The question was deferred as a larger SSIP question.
- Member Jamdar asked about the plan for the existing Biosolids Digesters. Chiu responded that they will be demolished after the new digesters are built.
- Chiu stated that they would like to come back to Full CAC to present the project design.

#### 8. Discussion and Possible Action: [Lake Merced Resolution](#)

Topics of Discussion:

- Member Clary reminded members that Lake Merced belongs to the SFPUC and is the city's the emergency water supply.
- Chair Aragon commended Members Groth and Zock for taking on an issue in their district.

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Jamdar) to approve [Lake Merced Resolution](#)

Public comment: None

The motion PASSED by the following vote: (11)

1. Wendy Aragon: Yes
2. Suki Kott: Member absent
3. Leslie Detaillandier: Yes
4. Amy Zock: Yes
5. Ted Loewenberg: Yes
6. Mark Connors: Member absent
7. Kelly Groth: Yes
8. Shalini Swaroop: Yes
9. Art Taylor: Yes
10. Marjorie Goodwin: Member absent
11. Jennifer Clary: Yes
12. Avni Jamdar: Yes
13. Nicole Sandkulla: Member absent
14. Rebecca Lee: Yes
15. Tamar Barlev: Yes
16. Eli Saddler: Member absent

#### 9. Discussion and Possible Action: [Balboa Reservoir Resolution](#)

Topics of Discussion:

- Chair Aragon drew attention to the new sponsors of the resolution: Chair Aragon, Member Groth, and Member Clary.
- Member Lee provided a context of the competing and diverse perspectives from Balboa Reservoir Citizen's Advisory Committee. The current draft development parameters have a goal of 50% of the total housing units to be affordable with a mandatory requirement of 33% of the total housing units to be affordable.
- Chair Aragon discussed the need to balance the interests of District 7, 11, and City College stakeholders.
- Member Clary stated that the area is a working class neighborhood and made a recommendation to lower the range for affordable housing from 150% AMI to 120% AMI.
- MOHCD stated that for a family of four, the Area Median Income at 150% is \$153,000. For a family of four, the AMI at 120% is about \$122K.
- Member Groth reported out Supervisor Yee office's support for 50-100% affordable housing on the property and would be interested in incorporating affordability into all of SFPUC's surplus lands.
- Member Loewenberg expressed that weighing in on the restrictions of the property is outside of the purview of the CAC. Member Clary responded by saying that the city has the authority to zone the property which impacts the fair market value.
- Member Barlev asked for clarification on the first resolve paragraph. Member Clary responded that the SFPUC has yet to designate the property as surplus property.

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Aragon) to amend agenda to include "up to 120% Area Median Income"

#### Public Comment

- Beth Rubenstein representing Supervisor Avalos spoke in support of the amendment and that housing for people making 150% of AMI is too close to market rate. District 7 has much lower levels of AMI.
- Charlie Sciammas from PODER spoke in support of the amendment and submitted a [handout](#) that gives examples of the types of people and occupations at the various levels of AMI from 120% and below.
- Mara Blitzer from MOHCD spoke against the amendment, stating that units sold to people who make 150% of AMI require less public subsidies to build than units for people who make 120% of AMI. Blitzer expressed that narrowing the band of people who qualify for affordable housing would increase the cost of building affordable housing, and housing for 60-120% of AMI housing is lacking in the city.

#### Motion Fails by the following vote (6)

1. Wendy Aragon: Yes
2. Suki Kott: Member absent
3. Leslie Detaillandier: Yes
4. Amy Zock: Yes
5. Ted Loewenberg: No
6. Mark Connors: Member absent
7. Kelly Groth: Yes
8. Shalini Swaroop: Yes
9. Art Taylor: No
10. Marjorie Goodwin: Member absent
11. Jennifer Clary: Yes
12. Avni Jamdar: No
13. Nicole Sandkulla: Member absent
14. Rebecca Lee: No
15. Tamar Barlev: No
16. Eli Saddler: Member absent

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Jamdar) to approve [Balboa Reservoir Resolution](#)

Public Comment:

- Charlie Sciammas spoke in favor of the resolution. He spoke about the challenges of the housing crisis for regular residents and ratepayers and the role of public lands to address this issue. He spoke about the opportunity for the city to increase its public investment in the property in order to maximize the public benefit.
- Beth Rubenstein from Supervisor Avalos' office spoke in favor of the resolution. She spoke about the inadequacy of current inclusionary policies and policies like Prop K to build enough affordable housing to address the housing need. She encourages greater public investment for greater public benefit.
- Jessie Fernandez from PODER speaks in favor of the resolution and encourages members to think about the people who need housing and whose voices are not heard at the table.
- Mara Blitzler from MOCHD responds to the question of the availability of funds for affordable housing. She expressed that MOHCD's budget is allocated up to 2025 and that the need for affordable housing exceeds the Mayor's budget available for affordable housing. She encourages the CAC and the Balboa Reservoir CAC to explore additional ways to fund affordable housing to maximize production now.
- Chair Aragon expressed her support for the resolution.

Public Comment submitted via email

- Kate Hartley, MOCHD: letter via [email](#)

The motion PASSED by the following vote: (10)

1. Wendy Aragon: Yes
2. Suki Kott: Member absent
3. Leslie Detaillandier: Yes
4. Amy Zock: Yes
5. Ted Loewenberg: No
6. Mark Connors: Member absent
7. Kelly Groth: Yes
8. Shalini Swaroop: Yes
9. Art Taylor: Yes
10. Marjorie Goodwin: Member absent
11. Jennifer Clary: Yes
12. Avni Jamdar: Yes
13. Nicole Sandkulla: Member absent
14. Rebecca Lee: Yes
15. Tamar Barlev: Yes
16. Eli Saddler: Member absent

**10. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions**

- Technology Policy Update and SFPUC Information Security Program (*tentative April*)
- SFPUC Strategic Plan (*tentative April*)
- Water Supply/Drought Update (*tentative May*)
- Environmental Justice Update (*tentative June*)
- Mountain Tunnel (*tentative September*)

Public comment: none

11. **Announcements/Comments** – The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Full CAC will take place at our regularly scheduled time on Tuesday, April 19, 2016.

Public comment: none

12. **Adjournment**

Motion was made (Taylor) and seconded (Swaroop) to adjourn meeting

Public comment: none

Meeting was adjourned at 7:10pm.

MINUTES