



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42

**SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
 RATE FAIRNESS BOARD  
 CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**Minutes of Special Meeting  
 Tuesday, February 7, 2023, 10:30 AM – 12:30 PM  
 (Approved March 17, 2023)**

**In-person Meeting:** San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), 525 Golden Gate Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Tuolumne Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

**Virtually Via Zoom:**

- 1. Modern Browser (WebRTC) [Best]**  
 Please join with a modern browser such as Google Chrome or Microsoft Edge (no additional installation required)
- 2. Mobile Apple iOS or Android devices:** Mobile users can also join with Zoom Cloud Meetings App on [Apple App Store](#) iOS or [Google Play Store](#) Android
- 3. Meeting [Link](#)**  
**Meeting ID:** 878 2605 7167  
**Passcode:** 609344
- 4. Join by Telephone [Audio only]:** US: +1 213 338 8477 or +1 669 219 2599 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 646 518 9805  
**Meeting ID:** 878 2605 7167  
**Passcode:** 609344

*Meeting will be recorded for minutes only and will not be published. By joining this meeting, you agree to be recorded during the duration of this meeting.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT & BEST PRACTICES**

- Public comment periods will be announced.
- Type your comments using the “Chat” tab. In chat box please **type "Public Comment"** preceding your comment.
- Comments will be read out loud by meeting moderator. If you have technical issues or questions, you may also send a private message to the moderator using direct message.
- We ask that public comments be made in a civil and respectful manner and that you address your remarks to the Board as a whole and not to individual Board Members or Staff.
- Listen in from a quiet location. Turn down any televisions or radios around you.

**London N. Breed**  
Mayor

**Newsha K. Ajami**  
President

**Sophie Maxwell**  
Vice President

**Tim Paulson**  
Commissioner

**Anthony Rivera**  
Commissioner

**Kate H. Stacy**  
Commissioner

**Dennis J. Herrera**  
General Manager



43 **MEETING AGENDA**

44  
45 *Materials Distributed: Regular Meeting Agenda for February 7, 2023; Adopt*  
46 *State Urgency Legislation 54953(e); Draft Special Meeting Minutes of January*  
47 *6, 2023; 2023 Water & Wastewater Rate Study: Rate Design presentation;*  
48 *Draft SFPUC Rate Fairness Board Bylaws*

49  
50 **1. Call to Order**

51  
52 *The special meeting of the SFPUC Rate Fairness Board (RFB) was called*  
53 *to order at 10:31 AM in-person and via teleconference.*

54  
55 **2. Roll Call**

| <b>Member Name/Title</b>                                      | <b>Appointed By</b>  |
|---|----------------------|
| Howard Ash, Chair, Residential City Retail Customer           | Board of Supervisors |
| Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager                   | City Administrator   |
| Ken Hinton, Budget and Revenue Analyst                        | Controller's Office  |
| Vishal Trivedi, Financial Analyst of Office of Public Finance | Controller's Office  |
| <i>Vacant</i> , City Retail Small Business Customer           | Board of Supervisors |
| <i>Vacant</i> , City Retail Large Business Customer           | Mayor's Office       |
| <i>Vacant</i> , Residential City Retail Customer              | Mayor's Office       |

56  
57 *Roll Call:*

- 58 • *Present: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon*  
59 *Member Trivedi arrived at 10:35 AM*
- 60 • *The RFB Secretary introduced Nancy Hom, SFPUC Chief Financial*  
61 *Officer and Assistant General Manager of Business Services.*

62  
63 **3. Adopt renewed findings under [State Urgency Legislation](#) to allow**  
64 **hybrid in-person meetings during the COVID-19 Emergency and direct**  
65 **the Rate Fairness Board Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at**  
66 **a Board Meeting within the next 30 days.**

67  
68 *Chair Ash requested this item to be moved from Item 6a to Item 3 in order*  
69 *to allow for hybrid in-person meetings during the COVID-19 Emergency.*

70  
71 *Public Comment: None*

72  
73 *Roll-call Vote:*

- 74 • *Ayes: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member Trivedi*

75  
76 **4. General Public Comment**

77 *Members of the public may address the Rate Fairness Board (RFB) on*  
78 *matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction but not on today's*  
79 *agenda.*

80

81 *Public Comment: David Pilpel expressed his support to continue to have hybrid*  
82 *Rate Fairness Board meetings.*

83

84 **5. Approval of the Special Meeting Minutes of January 6, 2023**

85 (Discussion and Action)

86

87 *Chair Ash asked Board for comments, questions, or concerns.*

88

89 *Chair Ash requested to revise lines 109 and 110 with “each specific customer*  
90 *class” and “each rate,” respectively.*

91

92 *The minutes of the special meeting of January 6, 2023, were adopted, as*  
93 *amended, unanimously upon a motion by Member McMahon and seconded by*  
94 *Member Trivedi.*

95

96 *Public Comment: None*

97

98 *Roll Call Vote:*

- 99 • *Ayes: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member Trivedi*

100

101 **6. Report of the Chair**

102

103 **a. 2023 Water & Wastewater Rate Study: Rate Design**

104 (Presentation and Discussion)

105 Steve Gagnon and John Wright, Raftelis

106

107 *Steve Gagnon and John Wright from Raftelis presented the 2023*  
108 *Water & Wastewater Rate Study: Rate Design. Presentation*  
109 *included the following topics: rate study basics, financial plan, fixed*  
110 *vs. variable charges and residential tier breakpoints in water, and*  
111 *wastewater and stormwater rates. Discussion transpired throughout*  
112 *presentation.*

113

114 *Member Hinton requested to see a graph of the multi-family bill*  
115 *impacts without the stormwater charge.*

116

117 *Public Comment: David Pilpel requested the slides to be posted on*  
118 *the RFB website. Mr. Pilpel inquired about what is assumed*  
119 *regarding water and wastewater real estate costs and revenues. He*  
120 *also inquired about the status on unaccounted for water (UFW)*  
121 *leaks.*

122

123 **7. Items Initiated by Board Members**

124 **a. Rate Fairness Board Bylaws**

125 (Discussion)

126

127 *Chair Ash expressed that he wanted some clarification on specific*  
128 *sections in the bylaws. Discussion transpired throughout.*

129

130 *Public Comment: David Pilpel suggested clarification on specific Rules*  
131 *in the bylaws. Mr. Pilpel noted there was inconsistency in Rule 6 and to*  
132 *clarify the terms for the Members of the Board. In Rule 7, he noted that*  
133 *there was only one required regular meeting and that the Members can*  
134 *schedule other regular or special meetings during this time. In Rule 12*  
135 *and Rule 14, Mr. Pilpel suggested to revise the language using*  
136 *“appointed time” instead of “appointed hour.” In Rule 17, he suggested*  
137 *to revise the language of “three members” to “majority of members*  
138 *present.” Mr. Pilpel also expressed his interest for continued hybrid*  
139 *Rate Fairness Board meetings.*

140

141 **8. Announcements and Requests for Future Agenda Items**

142 (Discussion)

143

144 *Chair Ash asked when the next meeting will be scheduled. In preparation*  
145 *for Prop 218 notice, the next meeting is tentatively scheduled for early to*  
146 *mid-March.*

147

148 *Public Comment: None*

149

150 **9. Adjournment**

151

152 *Meeting adjourned at 12:41 PM.*

153

154 **Accessible Meeting Policy:** To obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please  
155 contact the Rate Fairness Board Secretary at 415-554-3477 or via email at  
156 [RateFairnessBoard@sfwater.org](mailto:RateFairnessBoard@sfwater.org). Providing at least 72 hours notice will help to  
157 ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are  
158 available on-line at [https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)  
159 [fairness-board](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).

160  
161 **Meeting Procedures:** Public Comment will be taken before or during the  
162 Board's consideration of each agenda item. Speakers may address the Board  
163 for up to three minutes on that item. During General Public Comment,  
164 members of the public may address the Board on matters that are within the  
165 Board's jurisdiction and are not on the agenda. Procedures do not permit: 1)  
166 persons in the audience to vocally express support or opposition to statements  
167 by Board Member, by other persons testifying; 2) ringing and use of cell  
168 phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices; 3) bringing in  
169 or displaying signs in the meeting room; and 4) standing in the meeting room.  
170 The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing  
171 electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the  
172 Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s)  
173 responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-  
174 producing electronic devices.

175 **Know your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to  
176 serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions,  
177 boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct  
178 the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted  
179 before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For  
180 information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the  
181 San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the ordinance,  
182 contact by mail Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett  
183 Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102; phone at (415) 554-7724; fax at  
184 (415) 554-7854; or by e-mail at [soff@sfgov.org](mailto:soff@sfgov.org).

185 Citizens may obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance by printing Chapter  
186 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at  
187 <http://www.sfbos.org/sunshine>.

188 **311 Free Language Assistance:** 免費語言協助/ Ayuda gratuita con el idioma  
189 / Бесплатная помощь переводчиков / Trợ giúp Thông dịch Miễn phí /  
190 Assistance linguistique gratuite / 無料の言語支援/ 무료 언어 / 지원 / ការ“មឌជ”  
191 យអេលី ត“ងក“ម“โดยไม“ ้วยคําไจจ้ าย / Libreng tulong para sa wikang Tagalog ยເລືອດີ

192 **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements:** Individuals and entities  
193 that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action  
194 may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign &  
195 Governmental Conduct Code Sec. 2.100] to register and report lobbying  
196 activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the  
197 San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San

198 Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; web site  
199 at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

200 **Explanatory documents** that have been provided to the Board in connection  
201 with this agenda are available for public inspection online at  
202 [https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)  
203 [board](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).