



**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
 Citizens' Advisory Committee  
 Wastewater Subcommittee**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, May 9, 2023  
 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.  
 525 Golden Gate Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Tuolumne Conference Room**

Please be advised that Members of the SFPUC CAC will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every item. In addition to in-person public comment, the SFPUC CAC will hear remote public comment on each agenda item.

**Meeting URL**

<https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/85254505594?pwd=YkFxOUduSWRRb0FTVDgyVHhQTTh4QT09>

**Phone Dial-in**

669.219.2599

Find your local number: <https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/85254505594?pwd=YkFxOUduSWRRb0FTVDgyVHhQTTh4QT09>

**Meeting ID / Passcode**

852 5450 5594 / 261944

**Mission:** The Wastewater Subcommittee shall review sewage and stormwater collection, treatment, and disposal system replacement, recycling, and other relevant plans, programs, and policies ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#)).

**Members**

<b>Amy Nagengast, Chair (D8)</b>	Maika Pinkston (M-Enviro. Org)	Michelle Pierce (B-Enviro. Justice)
Douglas Jacuzzi (D4)	Moisés García (D9)	Andrea Baker (B-Small Business)

**D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayoral appointed, B = Board President appointed**

**Staff Liaisons:** Mayara Ruski Augusto Sa, Lexus Moncrease and Jotti Aulakh  
 Staff Email for Public Comment: [cac@sfwater.org](mailto:cac@sfwater.org)

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**1. Call to order and roll call at 5:40 pm**

Members present at roll call: (4) Nagengast, Jacuzzi, García, and Pinkston

Members Absent: (2) Pierce and Baker

**London N. Breed**  
 Mayor

**Newsha Ajami**  
 President

**Sophie Maxwell**  
 Vice President

**Tim Paulson**  
 Commissioner

**Tony Rivera**  
 Commissioner

**Kate Stacy**  
 Commissioner

**Dennis J. Herrera**  
 General Manager

**OUR MISSION:** To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient, and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.



Staff: Erin Corvinova, Angela Lowrey, Idil Bereket, and Ryan Batjiaka

Members of the Public: None

**2. Approve [March 14, 2023, Minutes](#)**

Chair Nagengast proposed a change to the Chair's report.

Motion was made (García) and seconded (Jacuzzi) to approve the March 14, 2023, Minutes as amended.

AYES: (4) Nagengast, Jacuzzi, García, and Pinkston

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (2) Pierce and Baker

Public Comment: None

**3. Report from the Chair**

- Welcome members, staff, and the public

Public Comment: None

**4. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda

Public Comment: None

**5. Presentation and Discussion: [Proposed 2023 Water and Sewer Rates Adjustment](#), Erin Corvinova, SFPUC Financial Planning Director, Angela Lowry SFPUC Senior Communications Specialist**

*Resources:* [Proposed Water & Sewer Rates for Fiscal Years 2024-26 FAQ](#)

*Presentation*

- Proposed FYE 2024-2026 Rate Adjustments
- Rate Setting Overview
- Reasons for Rising Costs: Aging Infrastructure, Seismic Reliability, Outdated Treatment Facilities, and Climate Change
- Cost Savings Approaches
- What is Changing?
- Stormwater Charge
- Stormwater Charge: Cost of Service Justification
- Lower Bills with Stormwater Credits
- Customer Bill Impacts
- How do we stack up to our peers?
- Resources for Customers
- Public Outreach
- Outreach to Low-Income, Immigrant, and BIPOC Communities
- Public Meetings

### *Discussion*

- **Staff Bereket** commented that the Green Infrastructure Grant Program was launched in 2019.
- **Chair Nagengast** asked whether other Bay Area utilities have stormwater charges separately identified in their bills. This question was related to the slide titled “How do we stack up to our peers?”.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that the SFPUC was unique because they have a combined sewer system and charge for all their stormwater management on the utility bill. She commented that all other California utilities, except for a portion of Sacramento, have separate sewer systems, and the jurisdiction for who manages it is complicated. Staff Corvinova provided an example of how EBMUD (East Bay Municipal Utility District) and the City of Oakland are listed together on the slide titled “How do we stack up to our peers?” because The City of Oakland is responsible for stormwater management and the collection system. She added that to receive an estimated bill for the City of Oakland and EBMUD, the SFPUC had to go through three different rate schedules to understand what a customer in Oakland pays for water and sewer.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked when the website to look up a parcel’s aerial image would be ready to allow customers to have a better understanding of impervious surfaces on their property.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that the portal should be ready by the end of May. She commented that customers could use their account information to access the website, which will show the billable areas for the stormwater charge. Staff Corvinova noted that having the website ready was a big undertaking because the SFPUC must map all their existing accounts to a parcel and make sure the data is accurate, which has been a three-year process.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked whether the portal would be connected to the property information data and the parcel number that is set by the Assessor’s Office.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that the SFPUC is using the parcel number set by the Assessor’s Office, but it would be a separate portal because the SFPUC protects the customers’ confidential information.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if there would be a link between the SFPUC portal and the Assessor’s Office.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that there was not a link, but the Wastewater Subcommittee should let the SFPUC know about which links should be added to the portal.

- **Member García** asked if it was a requirement that all parcels have water and sewer service.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that it is not a requirement, but properties without water service such as abandoned buildings will still have to pay for stormwater charges because there is runoff from their properties.

She commented that the SFPUC is manually reviewing every single parcel that fits into that category, and once those have been reviewed, the SFPUC will be opening an account for the stormwater portion of the bill in the name of the property owner.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked how the SFPUC was dividing the stormwater charge for different unit sizes within the same multi-family building.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that most multi-family buildings in San Francisco have a master meter, so the property manager is the only one that sees the bill. Staff Corvinova then added that there are also mixed used properties, and for those, the SFPUC has defaulted to splitting the charge evenly between every existing account on the property because they do not have access to square footage data for each unit. She noted that account holders on a shared parcel can submit a form stating that they all agree to how much each account holder should pay, but the SFPUC will not be getting involved in disputes between people on the same property.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked whether the \$1.89 per square foot per month would start July 1<sup>st</sup>.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that it was \$1.89 per 1,000 square feet. She commented that this rate was for the first year and it would gradually increase over time based on how much it costs the SFPUC to handle the stormwater runoff.

- **Member García** asked who would adjudicate appeals to the SFPUC.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that appeals regarding property measurements and account credits will be handled by dedicated staff within the SFPUC's Customer Services Bureau. She noted that the portal will have a button for customers to submit their appeals.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked if the aerial imagery will be periodically updated.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that the City of San Francisco already buys high resolution aerial imagery every year, which is what the SFPUC will use. She commented that the aerial imagery provided by the City is run through a GIS (Geographic Information System) processing system to classify permeable and impermeable areas. The SFPUC is looking into how often that information needs to be updated.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked if the SFPUC could provide more information on the seven-year increases.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that the next fiscal year is in the middle of a two-year budget cycle, so they wanted an odd number to line up with that. She commented that the SFPUC wanted to phase this in without going too fast, so the seven-year roll in felt doable. Staff Corvinova noted that the SFPUC is adopting three years of rates but adopted four years of rates in the past, skipped this year, and was now doing three years of rates because it would be two sets of rates. She added that by the end of the two sets of rates, the seven-year roll in will be phased in.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked what the rate would be for a big box store seven years from now.

**Staff Corvinova** responded that she would investigate and provide that information to the Wastewater Subcommittee.

- **Member Pinkston** commented that property managers would be interested in the SFPUC's outreach about the upcoming changes, but they are not present for public comment.

**Staff Lowrey** asked if there was a particular group Pinkston had in mind when she mentioned property managers.

**Member Pinkston** responded that she was thinking of bridge housing related management because they oversee public housing and are responsible for paying the water and sewer bills.

- **Staff Lowrey** commented that she reached out to those associations personally and did not receive a response.

**Member Pinkston** commented that associations are separate from property management.

**Staff Lowrey** responded that the SFPUC's campaign was still ongoing and asked Pinkston to provide her with the contact information of those in charge of bridge related housing management.

Public Comment: None

**6. Presentation and Discussion: [Biosolids Update](#), Ryan Batjiaka, SFPUC Senior Environmental Specialist**

*Resources: [July 2021 SFPUC CAC Biosolids Program Update](#)*

*Presentation*

- Biosolids Program Update
- Agenda
- Moving to resource recovery
- Soil Fertility – The Reason We Ate Yesterday
- Benefit of SFPUC Biosolids as a Fertilizer
- Benefit of Biosolids as a Fertilizer
- How were biosolids used in 2022?
- Continuing to transition away from landfill
- Regulatory updates
- Fertilizer use updates
- Oceanside TPAD
- Class A Biosolids at Southeast via THP
- Biosolids do amazing things

*Discussion*

- **Member Pinkston** asked what PFAS (Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances) stands for.

**Staff Batjiaka** responded that it stands for Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances, which are a group of substances that are a carbon and fluorine chain. He commented that carbon and fluorine is one of the strongest bonds in nature, so it is persistent. Staff Batjiaka noted that both carbon and fluorine have interesting chemical properties making them water and grease resistant. He added that they are used on rain jackets, stain resistant carpeting, food packages, and have many other uses, which is how people are exposed to them.

- **Member Pinkston** asked what PFOA (Perfluorooctanoic acid) stood for.

**Staff Batjiaka** responded that PFAS is a whole class containing thousands of different chemicals that share similar properties, while PFOA is just one of those. He commented that there have been a select group of them that are the most toxic and have been phased out of production in the United States.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked whether the SFPUC had analyzed the chemical that flows off petroleum product roofs into stormwater and then into the ground.

**Staff Batjiaka** commented that the SFPUC does not have great stormwater data. He noted that currently, the SFPUC is focusing on the input from residential wastewater and various businesses. Staff Batjiaka added that he would follow up with the Wastewater Subcommittee after speaking with the Green Science Policy Institute about runoff from petroleum product roofs.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked if it was still possible to use Class A biosolids on local farms.

**Staff Batjiaka** responded that production of a Class A product would require additional processing for use in a non-large-scale agricultural setting. He commented that other agencies that have produced a Class A product for local use have mixed the biosolids with other materials to improve the quality. Staff Batjiaka noted that if the SFPUC were to do that, they would use a third-party contractor offsite to create a product that was more user friendly and then bring the product back into the City. He added that there is also no appetite to increase the scope of the BDFP (Biosolids Digester Facilities Project).

- **Chair Nagengast** commented that the idea had been to create SFPUC manufactured compost to use at local gardens or sell at Home Depot. She then asked how much the SFPUC spends to haul away biosolids every year.

**Staff Batjiaka** responded that hauling and management totaled about \$5.7 million, which will continue to increase.

- **Member García** asked if that was for the whole system or just the Oceanside Plant.

**Staff Batjiaka** responded that it was for both the Southeast and Oceanside Plants.

Public Comment: None

## 7. Staff report

- The next Full CAC Meeting is a Special Meeting between the CAC and Southeast Facility Commission at 1550 Evans, on Wednesday May 24<sup>th</sup> at 6 pm.
- Reminder that District 1 and 7 seats are still vacant.

Public Comment: None

## 8. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- SFEI: San Francisco Estuary Institute Presentation – *Tentatively July*
- Treasure Island and Wastewater – *Tentatively July*
- Green infrastructure Grants Reform
- Westside Water Resources Presentation (Member Jacuzzi)
- WW Southeast Air Quality Presentation – *Tentatively May*
- WW Emergency Notification and Communication
- Stormwater Management Ordinance and Southeast Treatment Plant
- Upper Islais Creed Watershed Approach Update – *Tentative*
- Level of Service Goals Update and Annual Report – *Tentative*
- Wastewater Enterprise Competency Based Training System Update
- Regulation and Legislation for PFAS, Microplastics, and BPA
- Floodwater Grant Program
- Watershed Stewardship Grants
- Next Generation Green Infrastructure
- Racial Equity Plan – Funding to Support the Plan
- Job Creation at the Plant – City Works and Apprenticeship Program
- Wastewater CAC staff
- Asset Management Integration – policy and capital projects
- Wastewater Communications Update
- Upcoming Construction
- Workforce Programs and Qualifications
- Treasure Island Field Trip
- Environmental Justice Analysis briefing
- Environmental Justice in Capital Projects

### Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution in Support of SFPUC Class A Biosolids Local Distribution Program [adopted August 21, 2018](#)
- Resolution in Support of Cityworks Interns Recommendations [adopted on November 21, 2017](#)
- Resolution in Support of Equitable Green Infrastructure Implementation throughout the Southeast Sector of San Francisco and throughout the City [adopted on June 20, 2017](#)
- Resolution Urging SFPUC Commission to Initiate Planning and Environmental Review for Building a New Community Center at Third and Evans and to Direct Staff to Develop an Interim Greenhouse Environmental and Workforce Development Program [adopted on October 18, 2016](#)
- Resolution Supporting the SFPUC to Conduct Robust Community Engagement to Determine the Community's Preference for Remodeling Southeast Community Facility at 1800 Oakdale or Building a New Community Center at 1550 Evans [adopted on January 19, 2016](#)

Public Comment: None

9. **Announcements/Comments** Visit [www.sfpuc.org/cac](http://www.sfpuc.org/cac) for final confirmation of the next meeting date.

- **Chair Nagengast** noted that Assistant General Manager Greg Norby had left the SFPUC, and Joel Prather is the Acting Assistant General Manager for the Wastewater Enterprise.

Public Comment: None

**10. Adjournment**

Motion was made (Nagengast) and seconded (Jacuzzi) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:05 pm.